

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 1760

Date: 2008-05-27

REPLACES: _____

<p>ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32</p> <p>Data Management and Interchange</p> <p>Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI) Administered by Farance Inc. on behalf of ANSI</p>
--

DOCUMENT TYPE	Disposition of Comments
TITLE	Disposition of comments in 32N1623 Summary of Voting on CD3 20944-5 - Information technology - Metadata Registry Interoperability and Bindings (MDR-IB)
SOURCE	WG2 - Frank Farance - Project Editor
PROJECT NUMBER	1.32.17.01.05.00
STATUS	Disposition of comments in 32N1623 (comments on CD3 20944-5 ballot 32N1573). This accompanies FCD 20944-5 sent to NBs for 4 month letter ballot
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages	6
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair WG Conveners and Secretaries

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>
*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

Approved Canadian Comments on SC32 N1573 CD3 20944-5

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-06-27

Document: ISO/IEC CD3 20944-5

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 01	5.3	All	te	<p>In response to ballot comment CAN-P81-009 on CD2 20944-81, the editor provided the following explanation.</p> <p>The distinction between possible and available is: the "possible" concerns the value space from which the designations are chose, while the "available" concerns those ones that are valid. For example, in North America, phone numbers come from a possible list of 10-digit numbers "nnn-nnn-nnnn", but not all possible numbers are available, e.g., numbers whose first digits are 0 or 1 are not available ("022-222-2222" is not available).</p>	Include the explanation in clause 5.3.	Will incorporate change.
CA 02	5.7.20	having relation	te	There is a defect in ISO/IEC 11179-3:2003 +COR1, where the roles on the data_element_concept_concpetual_domain relationship are named differently in Figures 3 and Figure 8. The names used in Figure 3 are probably preferable. The defect should be corrected, and the result applied to this clause.	Requires discussion in WG2.	Unclear if any change is request in THIS document.
CA 03	5.7.21	having relation and specifying relation	te	There is a defect in ISO/IEC 11179-3:2003 +COR1, where the roles on the data_element_concept_concpetual_domain relationship are named differently in Figures 3 and Figure 8. The names used in Figure 3 are probably preferable. The defect should be corrected, and the result applied to this clause.	Requires discussion in WG2.	See above.
CA 04	5.7.29	last line	te	<p>representing_by_data_element_relation should be: represented_by_data_element_relation#index // optional</p>	Change: representing_by_data_element_relation to represented_by_data_element_relation#index // optional	Will fix.
CA 05	5.7.30	penultimate line	te	represented_by_data_element_relation should have an index and be optional.	Add: #index // optional	

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-06-27 Document: ISO/IEC CD3 20944-5

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA 06	5.7.31	3 rd line from bottom	te	represented_by_data_element_relation // optional needs an index	Add #index	

ISO

International Organization for Standardization



**ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Data Management and Interchange
WG 2
Metadata**

Title: Japan Ballot Comments on ISO/IEC CD3 20944-5

Status: Document to accompany ballot response

Author: Hajime Horiuchi

References:

[1] 32N15733, ISO/IEC CD 20944-5, Information technology — Metadata Registries Interoperability and Bindings(MDR-IB): Part5: Profiles

SEQ #	Cmnt ID	See Also	Severity	Reference	Description	Addressed By
ISO/IEC 2nd CD 19763-1						
001	JPN-P01-001		General	General	This project consolidation and its CD ballot resolution are grounded on only the WG2 resolutions at Huntsville, which have not yet authorized by the SC32 level resolution. So, this consolidated project is not yet initiated and cannot go to the CD stage. So, this CD ballot is void. See 6.2.2.1 and Item 3, 12.5.7, ISO/IEC JTC1 N8105 ISO/IEC JTC 1 Directives, 5th Edition, Version 1.0	Resolved at 2007-07 WG2 meeting.
002	JPN-P01-002		General	General	32N1573B-ballot for CD3 24944-5 says "Date of circulation: 2007-04-20, Closing date: 2007-07-15". However, 9.4.1, ISO/IEC JTC1 N8105 ISO/IEC JTC 1 Directives, 5th Edition, Version 1.0 says "In the case of CDs/PDAMs/PDISPs/PDTRs, this date should be no less than three months from the date of notification of issue." So, the closing date shall be after 2007-07-20.	Resolved at 2007-07 WG2 meeting.
003	JPN-P01-003		1-Major Technical	3.1 Definition of Metamodel Concepts 3.1.11 Upper Model	This document contains a lot of UML-like terms such as UML metaobject, UML features, UML relation sec., which are not defined anywhere in the document. "2. Normative references" shall include "ISO/IEC 19501:2005 Information technology -- Open Distributed Processing -- Unified Modeling Language (UML) Version 1.4.2 " and/or "ISO/IEC 19502:2005 Information technology -- Meta Object Facility (MOF) "and the terms defined there shall be used.	These are already included in 20944-1.

End of Paper

2	(3)	4	5		(6)	(7)
Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB		Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB	General		te	This part depends on ISO/IEC 11179-3. It should not progress beyond CD until it can be determined that all changes introduced during the current revision of 11179-3 have been accommodated.		WG2 agreed to continue
GB	2		te	The appropriate 11179 standards should be included in the normative references.		Will fix.
GB	4		ed	This is informative material and should be moved to an Annex.		Moved to Annex A.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.