

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32/WG 2

**Data Management and Interchange
Working Group 2
Metadata**

DOCUMENT TYPE	Meeting Report
TITLE	JTC 1/SC 32/ WG 2 Interim Meeting Report, 15-19 October 2012, Krakow, Poland
SOURCE	Keith Gordon (Interim Meeting Chair)
PROJECT NUMBER	
STATUS	Meeting Report
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages File Size (KB) Diskette Number Issue Number Filenames	
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair & Secretariat WG Conveners and Secretaries

**WG2 Interim Meeting Report
15-19 October 2012
Krakow, Poland**

1. Attendance

A total of 24 experts attended the meeting, either in person or by calling in.

JTC 1/SC 32/WG 2 Officers	
Denise Warzel*	JTC 1/SC 32/WG 2 Convenor
National Body Experts	Organization/Affiliation
<u>Australia</u>	
<u>Austria (O)</u>	
<u>Belgium</u>	
<u>Brazil</u>	
<u>Canada</u> Ray Gates Baba Piprani* Michael Gruninger*	None None University of Toronto
<u>China</u> Yangfan HE Jian WANG Zaiwen FENG Chong WANG	SKLSE, Wuhan University SKLSE, Wuhan University SKLSE, Wuhan University SKLSE, Wuhan University
<u>Czech Republic</u>	
<u>Denmark (O)</u>	
<u>Egypt</u>	
<u>Finland</u>	
<u>France (O)</u>	
<u>Germany</u> Jürgen Stausberg	Munich University

<u>Italy (O)</u>	
<u>Japan</u> Hajime HORIUCHI Masao OKABE Tatsumi ADACHI	JACIC Tokyo Electric Co NEC Corporation
<u>Kazakhstan</u>	
<u>Korea, Republic of</u> Doo-Kwon Baik Dongwon Jeong Sungjoon Lim Sukhoon Lee	Korea University Kunsan National University Korea Database Agency Korea University
<u>Netherlands, The</u>	
<u>Norway (O)</u> Knut Lindelien [♥]	Standards Norway
<u>Poland (O)</u> Ewelina Szczekocka [♥]	Telekomunikacja Polska S.A.
<u>Portugal</u>	
<u>Russian Federation (O)</u>	
<u>Sweden</u>	
<u>Switzerland (O)</u>	
<u>United Kingdom</u> Keith Gordon [*] Steve Harris ^{♥♦}	Independent, DAMA-UK Oxford University Computing Lab
<u>United States</u> Judith Newton Laura Reece [♦] Frank Farance [♦] Andy Schoka [♥]	Ashton Computing & Management Services, LLC, DAMA-I TASC Farance Inc AMSchoka Consulting

Notes:

* - Meeting Chair

♥ - Part time attendance for certain sessions only

♦ - Attendance by telephone for certain sessions only

2. Programme of Work update

2.1. Opening Session

We agreed the agenda in outline but accepted that this would be flexible to cope with the workload. We discussed amongst other things the 2013 meetings. Dates for Korea are Thursday 23 May to Friday 31 May (with the Open Forum in Seoul 20-21 May). Preferred location for the interim meeting from the WG2 participants present was Santa Fe with preferred dates of Monday 11 November to Friday 15 November.

NOTE: The final agenda is attached.

2.2. 11179-1 Ed 3 (Metadata registries (MDR) – Framework)

A ballot resolution meeting for the CD of Edition 3 (text for ballot SC32N2224; summary of voting SC32N2270) was carried out. The project editor (Dan Gillman) was not available so Frank Farance deputized for him by telephone call. There was some discussion as to the scope and it was decided that the scope of this part should be restricted to describing the parts of 11179 that would be in Edition 3, with all other material being the subject of, possibly, a TR. Dan was requested to come forward with a proposal for such a TR. On this basis all comments were satisfactorily resolved.

2.3. 11179-3 Ed 3 (Metadata registries (MDR) – Registry metamodel and basic attributes)

The WG agreed with the disposition of comments as specified in SC32N2272 and agreed that these dispositions had been correctly addressed in the text provided for FDIS ballot in SC32N2271 and there was consensus that this text should be forwarded by the SC32 Secretariat for FDIS ballot.

2.4. 11179-5 Ed 3 (Metadata registries (MDR) – Naming and identification principles)

Judith Newton led the resolution of the outstanding comments of the CD of Edition 3 (text for ballot SC32N2192; summary of voting SC32N2226; editor's draft resolution of comments WG2N1686). All outstanding comments were resolved satisfactorily.

**2.5. 20943-5
(Procedures for Achieving Metadata Registry Content Consistency –
Metadata Mapping Procedure)**

Sungjoon Lim provided an update on the progress of the DTR (text at SC32N2262). Sungjoon Lim suggested a change to TS or IS but it was suggested by the WG to leave it as it is.

**2.6. 20943-6
(Procedures for Achieving Metadata Registry Content Consistency –
Framework for Generating Ontologies)**

Sukhoon Lee provided an update on the progress of the DTR (text at SC32N2264). In the course of this presentation he suggested that there should be some discussion as to whether our standards should be conceptual models or implementation models (expressed in SQL etc), or whether we need a bridge between the conceptual models and their implementation. The outcome was that Korea was asked to prepare a discussion paper on this issue to be circulated at least six weeks before the Korea meeting. Discussion time would then be allocated on the agenda for the next meeting. Dongwon Jeong volunteered to be responsible for the production of this discussion paper.

**2.7. 19763-1 Ed 2
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Reference model)**

Hajime Horiuchi provided a presentation of the progress of this new part. He is to work with Keith Gordon to produce text for a CD ballot.

**2.8. 19763-5
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for process
model registration)**

Chong Wang led the resolution of comments on the CD4 ballot (text for ballot SC32N2258; summary of voting SC32N2276). Most comments were resolved satisfactorily. The only remaining issue, the alignment of definitions with those proposed by SC38, will be addressed through a discussion using Bugzilla. This discussion is to be completed by 30 November 2012. A further CD is required before DIS.

**2.9. 19763-6
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Registry Summary)**

Tatsumi Adachi and Laura Reece led the resolution of comments on the CD ballot (text for ballot SC32N2266; summary of voting SC32N2275). All comments were resolved satisfactorily. A further CD is required before DIS.

**2.10. 19763-7
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for service registration)**

Zaiwen Feng led the resolution of comments on the CD2 ballot (text for ballot SC32N2222; summary of voting SC32N2269). Most comments were resolved satisfactorily. The only remaining issue, the alignment of definitions with those proposed by SC38, will be addressed through a discussion using Bugzilla. This discussion is to be completed by 30 November 2012. A further CD is required before DIS.

**2.11. 19763-8
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for role and goal registration)**

Yangfan He led the resolution of comments on the CD2 ballot (text for ballot SC32N2196; summary of voting SC32N2229; editor's draft resolution of comments WG2 N1704). All comments were resolved satisfactorily. A further CD is required before DIS.

**2.12. 19763-9
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – On Demand Model Selection based on RGPS)**

Jiang Wang led the resolution of comments on the PDTR2 ballot (text for ballot SC32N2260; summary of voting SC32N2277). All comments were resolved satisfactorily except for US17. Jiang Wang is liaising with Denise Warzel over a resolution of this outstanding comment. A further PDTR is required before DTR.

**2.13. 19763-10
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Core model and basic mapping)**

Masao Okabe and Keith Gordon led the resolution of the outstanding comments of the CD (text for ballot SC32N2194; summary of voting SC32N2228; editor's draft resolution of comments WG2 N1698). All outstanding comments were resolved satisfactorily. A further CD is required. The expected date for this was 31 October but it is now expected to be delayed until 31 December whilst examples are created for inclusion in Annex A.

**2.14. 19763-12
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for information model registration)**

Keith Gordon provided an update on the progress of the draft for CD2. There was a discussion about the handling of 'database structures'. Keith suggested that the only database structures that should be handled are SQL structures,

probably limited to the SQL core facilities. The only foreseen difficulty is in the handling of datatypes.

**2.15. 19763-13
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for forms registration)**

Steve Harris provided an update on the progress of the draft text for a future CD ballot. No specific next step was agreed.

2.16. 24707 (Common Logic)

Michael Gruninger presented his proposal for a second edition of this standard. The proposal was supported. A more detailed proposal will be submitted for the Korea meeting. Michael also agreed to prepare and circulate to WG2 an overview of 24707 for WG2 to explain what it is intended use and identify some of the organizations that have adopted the current edition.

2.17. Study Period on Metadata for Cloud Computing

Ewelina Szczekocka gave an update on the progress of this study period. No specific next step was agreed.

2.18. Study Period on Fact Based Models

Baba Piprani led a discussion by telephone. This discussion was based on a paper circulated at WG2N1706. He plans to set up a discussion forum through the Standards Council of Canada to allow further discussion to take place. This is to consider four options: extend the current Part 12 metamodel to include fact based models; create a separate part of MFI for fact based models; map fact based models to the concept system of MDR Part3 Ed3; or decide that fact based models are out of the scope of WG2.

2.19. Relationship between 11179 and 19763

The question was raised as to how the various parts of 19763 should reference the types in Clause 5.5 of 11179-3 Ed3. Masao Okabe circulated a paper and a presentation but there was insufficient time for their full consideration. Keith Gordon identified some additional options so will circulate a discussion document to the 19763 editors for consideration. A Bugzilla discussion will also be set up. He will then update the 19763 Modelling Guidelines in time to inform the production of the texts for the next series of CD ballots.

2.20. Attendance of editors at WG meetings

Hajime Horiuchi raised the issue of the non-attendance of editors so that ballot resolution needed to be conducted by telephone. He commented that this made it very difficult for everyone (especially for those whose first language is not English) to follow what is going on. He strongly suggested that in future all editors should be required to attend meetings in person. Others strongly suggested that it would be impossible to make this a mandatory requirement. This issue could be overcome through the use of better technology and/or surrogate discussion leaders.

2.21. Length of CD ballots

It was agreed that the length of CD ballots should normally be three months.

2.22. Closing Session

We reviewed the draft text for this report.

3. Future Meetings

From	To	Meeting/Purpose	Location
2013-05-20	2013-05-21	Metadata Open Forum	Seoul, Korea
2013-05-23	2013-05-31	WG2 Meeting	Gyeongju, Korea
2013-05-27	2013-05-31	SC32 Plenary Meeting	Gyeongju, Korea
2013-11-11	2013-11-15	WG2 Interim Meeting	Santa Fe, USA

4. Action Items

- 4.1. Denise Warzel to organize the 2013 interim meeting at Santa Fe, starting 11 November 2013.
- 4.2. Horiuchi-san is requested to investigate the possibility of Japan hosting of the plenary meeting in 2014.
- 4.3. Keith Gordon is to investigate the possibility of hosting the 2014 interim meeting in Scotland.
- 4.4. Ray Gates is to inform the SC32 Secretariat that there is consensus to forward the 11179-3 Ed3 FDIS text for ballot.
- 4.5. All are to contribute to the discussion forum on fact based models when it is up and running.

- 4.6. All are to contribute to the discussion forum on metadata for cloud computing when it is up and running.
- 4.7. Keith Gordon is to update the 19763 modelling guidelines to reflect decisions made at this meeting. They are then to be circulated to the 19763 editors for comment and once agreed to be posted to the WG2 website.
- 4.8. Dongwon Jeong is to produce a discussion paper on the implementation of the WG2 conceptual models. This paper is to be available through the WG2 website at least six weeks before the Korea meeting.
- 4.9. Denise Warzel to raise with JTC1 whether SC32 is the appropriate body for the maintenance of 24707.
- 4.10. Michael Gruninger to produce a resolution for a project split to create a second edition of 24707 with himself as editor.
- 4.11. Michael Gruninger to produce a working draft of 24707 Ed 2 in time for discussion during Korea meeting.
- 4.12. Dan Gillman is to produce a discussion paper on the need for the production of a general description of metadata. This paper is to be available through the WG2 website at least six weeks before the Korea meeting.
- 4.13. Whether a Part 2 (Classification) is still relevant within Edition 3 of 11179 is to be discussed at the Korea meeting.

5. Potential work expected for the Korea meeting]

- 5.1. Resolution of comments on DTR 20943-5 (text for ballot currently with JTC1).
- 5.2. Resolution of comments on DTR 20943-6 (text for ballot currently with JTC1).
- 5.3. Resolution of comments on CD2 11179-1 Ed 3 (text for ballot expected 31 December 2012).
- 5.4. Resolution of comments on CD2 11179-5 Ed 3 (text for ballot now expected 31 December 2012).
- 5.5. Resolution of comments on CD 19763-1 Ed 2 (text for ballot expected 30 December 2012).
- 5.6. Resolution of comments on CD5 19763-5 (text for ballot expected 31 December 2012).
- 5.7. Resolution of comments on CD3 19763-6 (text for ballot expected 31 December 2012).

- 5.8. Resolution of comments on CD3 19763-7
(text for ballot expected 31 December 2012).
- 5.9. Resolution of comments on CD3 19763-8
(text for ballot expected 31 December 2012).
- 5.10. Resolution of comments on PDTR3 19763-9
(text for ballot expected 31 December 2012).
- 5.11. Resolution of comments on CD2 19763-10
(text for ballot expected 31 December 2012).
- 5.12. Resolution of comments on CD2 19763-12
(text for ballot expected 31 December 2012).
- 5.13. Discussion of the WD of 11179-6 Ed 3
(WD text expected 31 December 2012; coverage to be for both MDR and MFI).
- 5.14. Discussion of the WD of 24707 Ed2
(WD text expected end March 2013).
- 5.15. Discussion of the implementation of the WG2 conceptual models
(discussion paper expected end March 2013).
- 5.16. Discussion of the need for a general description of metadata
(discussion paper expected end March 2013).
- 5.17. Discussion of the outcome of the study period on fact based models.
- 5.18. Discussion of the outcome of the study period on metadata for cloud computing.
- 5.19. Discussion of the future of 11179-2.

6. Acclamations

- 6.1. We would like to thank Ewelina Szczekocka and her colleagues from Telekomunikacja Polska S.A. for arranging the meeting here in the beautiful city of Krakow.
- 6.2. We would like to thank Telekomunikacja Polska S.A. and IBM for hosting social events during the meeting.
- 6.3. We would like to thank Keith Gordon for chairing the meeting.
- 6.4. We would like to thank Masao Okabe for his work as action recorder.
- 6.5. We would like to thank Ray Gates for his continued work in the maintenance of the WG2 website.
- 6.6. We would like to thank all of the editors for their diligence and consideration when conducting resolution meetings.

**WG2 Interim Meeting
15-19 October 2012
Krakow, Poland
Final agenda**

Monday 15 October:

Opening session
Continuation (from Berlin) of ballot resolution of CD 11179-5 Ed 3
Discussion on Study Period for Fact Based Models
Presentation on progress of 19763-12
Discussion on Study Period for Metadata for Cloud Computing

Tuesday 16 October:

Presentation on progress of 20943-6
Presentation on progress of 20943-5
Presentation on progress of 19763-13
Ballot resolution of CD3 19763-8
Ballot resolution of CD2 19763-7
Presentation on need for a second edition of IS 24707

Wednesday 17 October:

Presentation on progress of 19763-1
Continuation (from Berlin) of ballot resolution of CD 19763-10
Ballot resolution of CD4 of 19763-5
Ballot resolution of CD of 19763-6

Thursday 16 October:

Continuation of ballot resolution of CD4 of 19763-5
Ballot resolution of PDTR2 of 19763-9
Continuation of ballot resolution of CD2 of 19763-7
Ballot resolution of 11179-1 Ed 3

Friday 17 October:

Closing session