

SC32N2376
WG2N1797

Date: 2013-05-30

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32/WG 2

Data Management and Interchange
Working Group 2
Metadata

DOCUMENT TYPE	Meeting Report
TITLE	JTC 1/SC 32/WG 2 Meeting Report, 23-31 May 2013, Gyeongju, Korea
SOURCE	Keith Gordon (Interim Meeting Chair)
PROJECT NUMBER	
STATUS	Meeting Report
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages File Size (KB) Diskette Number Issue Number Filenames	
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair & Secretariat WG Conveners and Secretaries

**WG2 Meeting Report
23-31 May 2013
Gyeongju, Korea**

1. Attendance

A total of 20 experts and 2 observers attended the meeting, either in person or by calling in for specific items.

JTC 1/SC 32/WG 2 Officers	
Denise Warzel [▼] Timothy Schoechle	JTC 1/SC 32/WG 2 Convenor JTC1/SC32 Secretary
National Body Experts	Organization/Affiliation
<u>Australia</u>	
<u>Austria (O)</u>	
<u>Belgium</u>	
<u>Brazil</u>	
<u>Canada</u> Baba Piprani Ray Gates [♦] Michael Gruninger [♦]	Metaglobal Systems None University of Toronto
<u>China</u> Rui Shi Jian Wang Zaiwen Feng Chong Wang Fei He	CESI (China Electronics Standardization Institute) SKLSE, Wuhan University SKLSE, Wuhan University SKLSE, Wuhan University SKLSE, Wuhan University
<u>Czech Republic</u>	
<u>Denmark (O)</u>	
<u>Egypt</u>	
<u>Finland</u>	
<u>France (O)</u>	

<u>Germany</u>	
<u>Italy (O)</u>	
<u>Japan</u> Hajime Horiuchi Masao Okabe Tatsumi Adachi	UMTP (NPO) Tohoku Institute of Technology NEC Corporation
<u>Kazakhstan</u>	
<u>Korea, Republic of</u> Doo-Kwon Baik Dongwon Jeong Sukhoon Lee Jangwon Gim Taesul Seo Sungjoon Lim <u>Observers</u> Euijong Lee Changhan Lee	Korea University Kunsan National University Korea University KISTI KISTI Korea Database Agency Korea University Korea Database Agency
<u>Netherlands, The</u>	
<u>Norway (O)</u>	
<u>Poland (O)</u>	
<u>Portugal</u>	
<u>Russian Federation (O)</u>	
<u>Sweden</u>	
<u>Switzerland (O)</u>	
<u>United Kingdom</u> Keith Gordon*	Independent, DAMA-UK
<u>United States</u> Judith Newton [†]	Ashton Computing & Management Services, LLC, DAMA-I

Notes:

* - Meeting Chair

† - Did not attend this meeting

‡ - Attendance by telephone for certain sessions only

2. Programme of Work update

2.1. 11179-1 Ed 3 (Metadata registries (MDR) – Framework)

The expected CD2 ballot for Edition 3 of this part had not taken place, so there was no discussion of this standard.

AFTERNOTE: The editor has agreed to produce a CD2 text within two weeks.

2.2. 11179-5 Ed 3 (Metadata registries (MDR) – Naming and identification principles)

Judith Newton led the resolution of the comments on CD2 of Edition 3 (text for ballot SC32N2280; summary of voting SC32N2331). This was carried out over two sessions, with the second session attended by Ray Gates. There were conflicting comments, one comment from CA proposing removal of the reference to identification from the title and a set of comments from US proposing extension of the scope to include identifiers and codes. This was resolved in favour of the CA comment. All other outstanding comments were resolved satisfactorily.

DECISIONS: (1) Title to be changed to “Naming principles”
(2) Ballot text for CD3 to be available by 14 July 2013
(3) If CD3 ballot is successful , ballot text for DIS to be available by 31 December 2013
(4) If CD3 ballot is unsuccessful , ballot text for CD4 to be available by 31 December 2013

2.3. 11179-6 Ed 3 (Metadata registries (MDR) – Framework)

It was noted that there has been no progress on the production of Edition 3 of this part of MDR. The WG felt that the production of this part should be a priority.

2.4. 20943-5 (Procedures for Achieving Metadata Registry Content Consistency – Metadata Mapping Procedure)

Taesul Seo led the resolution of the comments on the DTR (text at SC32N2262; summary of voting SC32N2324). All outstanding comments were resolved satisfactorily.

DECISIONS: (1) Text for TR to be provided to SC32 Secretariat as soon as possible

**2.5. 20943-6
(Procedures for Achieving Metadata Registry Content Consistency –
Framework for Generating Ontologies)**

Dongwon Jeong led the resolution of the comments on the DTR (text at SC32N2264; summary of voting SC32N2325). All outstanding comments were resolved satisfactorily.

DECISIONS: (1) Text for TR to be provided to SC32 Secretariat as soon as possible

**2.6. 19763-1 Ed 2
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Reference model)**

Hajime Horiuchi led a discussion on his latest working draft (WG2N1790). It was agreed that this working draft went beyond the scope of a framework document. It was also noted that this project does not appear in the current Programme of Work.

DECISIONS: (1) Project subdivision required to create project with Hajime Horiuchi and Keith Gordon as project editors
(2) Title to be changed to “Framework”
(3) Ballot text for CD to be available by 30 November 2013, although the editors will endeavor to make the text for CD to be available by 14 July 2013

**2.7. 19763-5
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for process
model registration)**

Chong Wang and Fei He led the resolution of comments on the CD5 ballot (text for ballot SC32N2282; summary of voting SC32N2332). All comments were resolved satisfactorily.

DECISIONS: (1) Ballot text for CD6 to be available by 14 July 2013
(2) If CD6 ballot is successful, ballot text for DIS to be available by 31 December 2013
(3) If CD6 ballot is unsuccessful, ballot text for CD7 to be available by 31 December 2013

**2.8. 19763-6
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Registry Summary)**

Tatsumi Adachi led the resolution of comments on the CD2 ballot (text for ballot SC32N2285; summary of voting SC32N2333). All comments were resolved satisfactorily.

DECISIONS: (1) Ballot text for DIS to be available by 31 December 2013 after sneak-peek on WG2 website

**2.9. 19763-7
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for service registration)**

Zaiwen Feng led the resolution of comments on the CD3 ballot (text for ballot SC32N2287; summary of voting SC32N2334). All comments were resolved satisfactorily.

DECISIONS: (1) Ballot text for CD4 to be available by 14 July 2013
(2) If CD4 ballot is successful , ballot text for DIS to be available by 31 December 2013
(3) If CD4 ballot is unsuccessful , ballot text for CD5 to be available by 31 December 2013

**2.10. 19763-8
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for role and goal registration)**

Chong Wang led the resolution of comments on the CD3 ballot (text for ballot SC32N2289; summary of voting SC32N2335). All comments were resolved satisfactorily.

DECISIONS: (1) Ballot text for CD4 to be available by 14 July 2013
(2) If CD4 ballot is successful , ballot text for DIS to be available by 31 December 2013
(3) If CD4 ballot is unsuccessful , ballot text for CD5 to be available by 31 December 2013

**2.11. 19763-9
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – On Demand Model Selection based on RGPS)**

Jian Wang led the resolution of comments on the PDTR3 ballot (text for ballot SC32N2291; summary of voting SC32N2336). All comments were resolved satisfactorily.

DECISIONS: (1) Ballot text for PDTR4 to be available by 14 July 2013
(2) If PDTR4 ballot is successful , ballot text for DTR to be available by 31 December 2013
(3) If PDTR4 ballot is unsuccessful , ballot text for PDTR5 to be available by 31 December 2013

**2.12. 19763-10
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Core model and basic mapping)**

Masao Okabe and Keith Gordon led the resolution of the comments on CD2 (text for ballot SC32N2301; summary of voting SC32N2340). All outstanding comments were resolved satisfactorily.

- DECISIONS:
- (1) Ballot text for CD3 to be available by 14 July 2013
 - (2) If CD3 ballot is successful , ballot text for DIS to be available by 31 December 2013
 - (3) If CD3 ballot is unsuccessful , ballot text for CD4 to be available by 31 December 2013

**2.13. 19763-11
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Structured model registering)**

It was noted that there has been no progress on this part of 19763 since the initial working draft.

- DECISIONS: (1) Project to be withdrawn

**2.14. 19763-12
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for information model registration)**

Keith Gordon led the resolution of the outstanding comments of CD2 (text for ballot SC32N2293; summary of voting SC32N2337). All outstanding comments were resolved satisfactorily.

- DECISIONS:
- (1) Ballot text for CD3 to be available by 14 July 2013
 - (2) If CD3 ballot is successful , ballot text for DIS to be available by 31 December 2013
 - (3) If CD3 ballot is unsuccessful , ballot text for CD4 to be available by 31 December 2013

**2.15. 19763-13
(Metamodel Framework for Interoperability (MFI) – Metamodel for forms registration)**

Keith Gordon (on behalf of Steve Harris) introduced the working draft text.

- DECISIONS: (1) Ballot text for CD to be available by 14 July 2013

2.16. 24706-1 (Metadata for technical standards and specifications documents - Document description elements)

It was noted that there has been no progress on this part of 24706 since the initial FCD in December 2009.

DECISIONS: (1) Project to be withdrawn

2.17. 24706-2 (Metadata for technical standards and specifications documents - URI naming and resolution techniques)

It was noted that there has been no progress on this part of 24706 since the project was proposed in 2009.

DECISIONS: (1) Project to be withdrawn

2.18. 24707 (Common Logic)

Michael Gruninger presented further and more detailed justification for his proposal for a second edition of this standard.

DECISIONS: (1) Project subdivision required to create project to develop a second edition with Michael Gruninger as project editor
(2) Ballot text for CD to be available by 14 July 2013.

2.19. Study Group on Metadata for Cloud Computing

Baba Piprani gave an update on the progress of this study group. Documents WG2N1798 and WG2N1799 refer. The work of the study group is not yet complete due to recent release of related SC38 CDs.

DECISIONS: (1) An extension to the Study Group is required.

2.20. Study Group on Fact Based Models

Baba Piprani gave an update on the progress of this study group. Document WG2N1801 refers. The study group has concluded that a separate part of 19763 is required to allow the registration of fact based models to enable interoperability.

DECISIONS: (1) That the Study Group has completed its work.

2.21. Study Group on Proof of Concept Implementations of WG2 Standards

There was a ballot comment that there should be a proof of concept implementation for the particular part that was the subject of the comment. In discussion we felt that there should be a common approach across all of the

standards within the 11179 and 19763 series. It was proposed to initiate a study group to determine how best to progress this work and Dongwon Jeong and Tatsumi Adachi agreed to be co-convenors.

DECISIONS: (1) That a resolution be raised to initiate this study group.

2.22. Closing Session

We reviewed the draft resolutions and the draft text for this report.

3. Future Meetings

From	To	Meeting/Purpose	Location
2013-11-11	2013-11-15	WG2 Interim Meeting	Santa Fe, USA
2014-??-??	2014-??-??	Metadata Open Forum	???, China
2014-??-??	2014-??-??	WG2 Meeting	???, China
2014-??-??	2014-??-??	SC32 Plenary Meeting	???, China
2014-??-??	2014-??-??	WG2 Interim Meeting	???, Scotland, UK

4. Action Items

- 4.1. All editors are requested to send a draft disposition of comments to the WG2 website one week before the start of the ballot resolution meeting, with comments arranged in 'clause order'.
- 4.2. All experts are requested to review the published draft dispositions of comments and feedback comment to project editors before the production of the next draft.
- 4.3. Dan Gillman is to produce a discussion paper on the need for the production of a general description of metadata. This paper is to be available through the WG2 website at least six weeks before the Sante Fe meeting.
- 4.4. Hajime Horiuchi is to produce a discussion paper on the need for the production of a general description of metamodels. This paper is to be available through the WG2 website at least six weeks before the Sante Fe meeting.
- 4.5. Whether a Part 2 (Classification) is still relevant within Edition 3 of 11179 is to be discussed at the Sante Fe meeting.
- 4.6. Denise Warzel is to investigate the future involvement of Laura Reese in WG2 and, if necessary, find a replacement co-editor for 11179-6 and 19763-6.
- 4.7. Denise Warzel is to hasten the development of 11179-6 Edition 3.

- 4.8. Keith Gordon is to further investigate the possibility of hosting the 2014 interim meeting in Scotland.
- 4.9. Keith Gordon is to produce a draft of an improved conformance clause for the parts of 19763.
- 4.10. Keith Gordon is to update the 19763 modelling guidelines to reflect decisions made at this meeting. They are then to be circulated to the 19763 editors for comment and once agreed to be posted to the WG2 website.

5. Potential work expected for the Sante Fe meeting

- 5.1. Resolution of comments on CD2 11179-1 Ed 3 (text for ballot expected 14 July 2013).
- 5.2. Resolution of comments on CD3 11179-5 Ed 3 (text for ballot now expected 14 July 2013).
- 5.3. Resolution of comments on CD 19763-1 Ed 2 (text for ballot expected 30 November 2013 but may be available 14 July 2013).
- 5.4. Resolution of comments on CD6 19763-5 (text for ballot expected 14 July 2013).
- 5.5. Resolution of comments on CD4 19763-7 (text for ballot expected 14 July 2013).
- 5.6. Resolution of comments on CD4 19763-8 (text for ballot expected 14 July 2013).
- 5.7. Resolution of comments on PDTR4 19763-9 (text for ballot expected 14 July 2013).
- 5.8. Resolution of comments on CD3 19763-10 (text for ballot expected 14 July 2013).
- 5.9. Resolution of comments on CD3 19763-12 (text for ballot expected 14 July 2013).
- 5.10. Resolution of comments on CD 24707 Ed2 (text for ballot expected 14 July 2013).
- 5.11. Discussion of the WD of 11179-6 Ed 3 (WD text expected before the interim meeting; coverage to be for both MDR and MFI).
- 5.12. Discussion on any comments, if any, on the sneak peek of DIS 19763-6.
- 5.13. Discussion on the result of the ballot for the “Concepts and usage of metadata” new work item.

- 5.14.** Discussion of the need for a general description of metadata (may be linked with 5.13 above)
(discussion paper now expected end September 2013).
- 5.15.** Discussion of the progress or outcome of the study period on metadata for cloud computing.
- 5.16.** Discussion of the progress or outcome of the study period on proof of concept implementations.
- 5.17.** Discussion of the future of 11179-2.

**WG2 Meeting
23-31 May 2013
Gyeongju, Korea
Final agenda**

Thursday 23 May:

Ballot resolution of CD2 11179-5 Ed 3 (not completed)
Ballot resolution of CD2 19763-12
Presentation on progress of 19763-13

Friday 24 May:

Ballot resolution of DTR 20943-6 (not completed)
Ballot resolution of CD2 19763-10 (not completed)
Ballot resolution of CD5 19763-5 (not completed)

Monday 27 May:

(SC32 Plenary)
WG Opening session
Ballot resolution of DTR 20943-5

Tuesday 28 May:

Continuation of ballot resolution of DTR 20943-6
Continuation of ballot resolution of CD2 11179-5 Ed 3
Continuation of ballot resolution of CD2 19763-10
Ballot resolution of CD3 19763-8
Ballot resolution of CD3 19763-7
Ballot resolution of PDTR3 of 19763-9
Continuation of ballot resolution of CD5 19763-5

Wednesday 29 May:

Presentation on development of a second edition of 24707
Ballot resolution of CD2 of 19763-6
Presentation on progress of the second edition of 19763-1

Thursday 30 May:

Preparation of resolutions
Discussion of report
Discussion on Study Period for Fact Based Models
Discussion on Study Period for Metadata for Cloud Computing

Friday 31 May:

(SC32 Closing Plenary)