

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 2432

Date: 2013-10-24

REPLACES: —

<p style="text-align: center;">ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Data Management and Interchange</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI) Administered by Farance Inc. on behalf of ANSI</p>
--

DOCUMENT TYPE	Summary of Voting/Table of Replies
TITLE	Summary of Voting on 32N2407 PDTR4 19763-9 Information technology - Metamodel framework for interoperability (MFI) Part 9: On demand model selection
SOURCE	SC32 Secretariat
PROJECT NUMBER	1.32.22.01.09.00
STATUS	The document obtained substantial support. WG2 is requested to address the comments and revise the draft text accordingly.
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	ACT
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages	10
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair WG Conveners and Secretaries

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>
*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N2432

Summary of Voting on Document SC 32 N 2407

Title: PDTR4 19763-9 Information technology - Metamodel framework for interoperability (MFI) Part 9: On demand model selection

Project: 1.32.22.01.09.00

"P" Member	Approval	Approval with Comments	Disapproval with Comments	Abstention with Comments
Canada			1	
China	1			
Czech Republic	1			
Egypt				
Finland				1
Germany				1
India				1
Japan			1	
Korea, Republic of	1			
Portugal				1
Russian Federation	1			
United Kingdom		1		
United States		1		
Total "P"	4	2	2	4
"O" Member				
Austria				
Belgium				
France				1
Ghana				
Hungary				
Indonesia				
Italy				
Kazakhstan				
Netherlands, The				
Norway				
Romania				
Poland				
Sweden				
Switzerland				
Total "O"				

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32

Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America

Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org

available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>

*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

COMMENTS:

Canada

NO. See comments below:

Finland

ABSTAIN. Lack of expertise and interest.

Germany

ABSTAIN. Lack of expertise and interest.

India

ABSTAIN. Lack of expertise and interest.

Japan

NO. See comments below:

Portugal

ABSTAIN. Lack of expertise and interest.

United Kingdom

YES See comments below:

United States

YES. See comments below:

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
CA 00	All	All	-	Ge	Canada disapproves of the draft for the reasons below.	Canada will change its vote to Approval if the comments below are satisfactorily addressed.	
CA 01	109-121	2	All	Ed	Where standard numbers are specified in normative references, the usual convention is to use a 'no break space' (Ctrl-Shift-Space) between the ISO/IEC prefix and the following number. This prevents the space expanding in size when text is distributed across the width of the page.	Replace: ISO/IEC 19763-1 By: ISO/IEC 19763-1 And similarly for other references.	Accepted.
CA 02	123-124	3.1	Terms	Ed	Referencing definitions from other standards without actually including them requires the reader to obtain and access those other standards. This document would be more usable if the required terms and definitions were repeated here, with references to indicate from whence they come. The editor's note at line 134 partially addresses this concern, but a check needs to be made for other terms whose definitions exist elsewhere.	For all terms used in this standard, include the terms and definitions in clause 3.1, with a reference to the source.	Accepted. We will confirm the terms used in the standard to have a reference to the source.
CA 03	149	3.2	UML	Te	The UML reference is to an obsolete standard (ISO/IEC 19501:2005)	Replace by ISO/IEC 19505-1:2012 and ISO/IEC 19505-2:2012	Accepted.
CA 04	435-436	Bibliography	Ref [2]	Ed	A reference to 19763-6 is included with the incorrect title "Registration procedure". The title of 19763-6 is now Registry Summary. The registration procedure is covered in 11179-6 Registration which is listed as a Normative Reference in clause 2. Is the reference to 19763-6 needed? Why?	Either remove the reference to 19763-6, or correct it if it is deemed to be useful.	Accepted. Remove the reference to 19763-6
CA 99				Ge	If any further problems are discovered before or during the Comment Resolution Meeting, and a consensus can be reached on a solution, then they should be corrected.	To be determined at the CRM as required.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
JP0 1				ge	<p>There is no answer and proposed solution for JP01 in 32N2408.</p> <p>Comments: "Since the completeness of MFI-5, 7, 8 which this part makes the basis is not high, a comment is not made."</p> <p>Proposed Change: "This part should be recognized synchronizing with MFI-5,7, 8."</p>		We will defer the DTR ballot of MFI-9 to synchronize with MFI-5,7,8. But according to the resolution of WG2 meeting, we need another PDTR.
					End of comments		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB 01	General		ge	Although our vote is approval, progression of this part should be delayed until Parts 5, 7 and 8 are progressed.	None provided	
GB 02	Foreword	Line 71 (pdf)	ed	The title of part 1 has changed.	Amend to read "Framework"	Accepted
GB 03	Foreword	Line 79 (pdf)	ed	Part 11 has been cancelled.	Delete reference to part 11	Accepted
GB 04	Introduction	Lines 83-85 (pdf)	ed	"ISO/IEC Technical Report 19763-9, Information technology – On demand model selection based on RGPS, was prepared by Joint Technical Committee ISO/IEC JTC 1, Information technology, Subcommittee SC 32, Data management and interchange." This repeats detail included in the Foreword.	Delete this paragraph	Accepted
GB 05	Introduction	Lines 90-91 (pdf)	ed	"in business domain, such as." Mixing singular and plural.	Amend to read "in business domains, such as."	Accepted
GB 06	2	Lines 109-110 (pdf)	ed	The title of part 1 has changed.	Amend to read "Framework"	Accepted
GB 07	4.1	Line 228 (pdf)	ed	"associations in metamodels defined in." Missing word.	Amend to read "associations in the metamodels defined in."	Accepted
GB 08	4.2	Line 250 (pdf)	ed	"RGPS models enable the ontology" Mixing singular and plural.	Amend to read "RGPS models enables the ontology"	Accepted
GB 09	5.1	Lines 286-287 (pdf)	ed	Lack of white space.	Add extra white space between these two lines.	Accepted
GB 10	5.1	Lines 298-299 (pdf)	ed	Lack of white space.	Add extra white space between these two lines.	Accepted
GB 11	Annex A	Figure A.1 – Line 423 (pdf)	ed	Some arrowheads are missing from the "achieves" and "realizes" lines are missing.	Add arrowheads where necessary.	Accepted.
GB 12	Annex A	Figure A.1 – Line 423 (pdf)	te	Inconsistency – on the Process Model the start event is shown with a 'white blob' yet in the legend start events are shown as using a 'black blob'.	Amend process model or legend as necessary to maintain consistency .	Accepted.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB 13	Annex A	Figure A.2 – Line 425 (pdf)	te	Object103 – missing references	Add “Object106, Object107, Object109, Object110, Object111” to “set_goal”	Accepted.
GB 14	Annex A	Figure A.2 – Line 425 (pdf)	te	Object106 – missing reference	Add reference “achieving_process”, “Object204”	Accepted.
GB 15	Annex A	Figure A.2 – Line 425 (pdf)	te	Object109 – missing reference	Add reference “achieving_process”, “Object206”	Accepted.
GB 16	Annex A	Figure A.2 – Line 425 (pdf)	te	Object110 – missing reference	Add reference “achieving_process”, “Object210”	Accepted.
GB 17	Annex A	Figure A.2 – Line 425 (pdf)	te	Object111 – missing reference	Add reference “achieving_process”, “Object211”	Accepted.
GB 18	Annex A	Figure A.3 – Line 428 (pdf)	te	Object201 – unused reference	Delete reference “describing_process”	Accepted.
GB 19	Annex A	Figure A.3 – Line 428 (pdf)	te	Object204 – missing reference	Add reference “fully_realizing_service_operation”, “Object304”	Accepted.
GB 20	Annex A	Figure A.3 – Line 428 (pdf)	te	Object206 – missing reference	Add reference “fully_realizing_service_operation”, “Object307”	Accepted.
GB 21	Annex A	Figure A.3 – Line 428 (pdf)	te	Object208 and Object209 – incorrect guard conditions	Amend guard condition of Object 208 to read “Display_of_order_in_map_required” and amend guard condition of Object 209 to read “Integrity_check_required”	Accepted.
GB 22	Annex A	Figure A.3 – Line 428 (pdf)	te	Object210 – missing reference	Add reference “fully_realizing_service_operation”, “Object310, Object313”	Accepted.

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB 23	Annex A	Figure A.3 – Line 428 (pdf)	te	Object211 – missing reference	Add reference “fully_realizing_service_operation”, “Object317”	Accepted.
GB 24	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object303 – misnamed reference	Delete “contained_operation”, insert “contained_service_operation”	Accepted.
GB 25	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object304 – missing reference	Add reference “containing_service”, “Object303”	Accepted.
GB 26	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object306 – misnamed reference	Delete “contained_operation”, insert “contained_service_operation”	Accepted.
GB 27	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object307 – missing reference	Add reference “containing_service”, “Object306”	Accepted.
GB 28	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object309 – misnamed reference	Delete “contained_operation”, insert “contained_service_operation”	Accepted.
GB 29	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object310 – missing reference	Add reference “containing_service”, “Object309”	Accepted.
GB 30	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object312 – misnamed reference	Delete “contained_operation”, insert “contained_service_operation”	Accepted.
GB 31	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object313 – missing reference	Add reference “containing_service”, “Object312”	Accepted.
GB 32	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object316 – misnamed reference	Delete “contained_operation”, insert “contained_service_operation”	Accepted.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB 33	Annex A	Figure A.4 – Line 430 (pdf)	te	Object317 – missing reference	Add reference “containing_service”, “Object316”	Accepted.
GB 34	Bibliography	Lines 432-438 (pdf)	ge	Are the three items included here relevant?	Consider removing bibliography	Accepted. Remove the bibliography.
GB 35	Bibliography	Lines 432-438 (pdf)	ge	19763-6 is now “Registry Summary”	Amend name	Since the bibliography will be removed, this item will also be removed.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 26 August 2013	Document: SC 32 N 2407	Project: 19763-09
----------------------	-------------------------------	-------------------

MB/NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
US-01		All		ge	There is frequent use of phrases such as “user’s request”, “user’ requests”, etc. Some of these are ungrammatical, and the different usages are unnecessary and confusing.	Change all instances to “user-requests” and make sure the sentence is consistent with the plural form.	Accepted.
US-02		Annex A		te	Since 19763-3 is a normative reference and ontologies registered in accordance with this standard are necessary to make the procedure specified in clauses 5 and 6 work, it is surprising that no ontologies are used or referred to in the example in the Annex.	<p>Add reference to appropriate ontologies to the example. In particular, show how a user request matching ontology entries is used in the subsequent steps.</p> <p>In WG2 meeting, US adds more comments:</p> <p>We do not feel Figure A.1 needs to show all the concept annotations, but add a note on the figure that concept annotations as described in parts 8, 5, 7 are used to facilitate search.</p>	<p>Accepted.</p> <p>According to the discussion in WG2 meeting, we add concept annotations in registration examples (Figure A.2, A.3, and A.4).</p> <p>The following sentence are used to explain the matching steps:</p> <p>“Firstly, the model selection engine will search a registry based on the metamodel defined in ISO/IEC 19763-3 to find concepts that match the user-requests. In this example, the concept “Deliver_Goods” in a domain ontology can be matched. Then the model selection engine will search models using the concept to match against the semantic annotations of models registered in the registry based on the metamodel defined in ISO/IEC 19763-8, as shown in Figure A.2. The goal “Deliver_Goods_To_Other_People” which is annotated by the concept</p>

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 26 August 2013	Document: SC 32 N 2407	Project: 19763-09
----------------------	-------------------------------	-------------------

MB/NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
							"Deliver_Goods" can be matched."

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial