

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32/WG2/N1949

Date: 2014-06-13

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32/WG 2

**Data Management and Interchange
Working Group 2
Metadata**

DOCUMENT TYPE	Resolutions
TITLE	JTC 1/SC 32/ WG 2 Convenor’s Report
SOURCE	Denise Warzel SC 32/WG 2 Convenor
PROJECT NUMBER	
STATUS	DRAFT Convenor’s Report
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	WG2 meeting attendees for Review and comment
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages File Size (KB) Diskette Number Issue Number Filenames	
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair & Secretariat WG Conveners and Secretaries

SC32 WG2 Meeting – Convenor’s Notes - Beijing 2014 WG2N1949

to a resolution of FDIS ballot to be issued by 2014-09-30, so it would close before the interim meeting.

Resolutions:

1. FDIS 19763-10 Core model and basic mapping 2014-09-30

CD 24707 Gruninger

SC32 N2477

Reviewed comments and agreed on disposition. Sneak-peek by Aug-31.

Resolutions:

1. DIS ballot to be issued by 12-31-2014

SC32 Plenary Notes

- Add Liaison report to SC32 agenda. A liaison is able to attend as an observer and get documents from the liaison committee that may be pertinent to SC32. Each WG will be asked to update the list and remove names that are not actively working as a liaison.

- SC38 has two new work items that may pertain to WG2 standards, Cloud Computing Interoperability and Portability SC38N1005, Data and their Flow Across Devices and Cloud Services SC38N1010

- All documents must be put into JTC1 LiveLink. Keith Hare will help WG2 get documents posted on LiveLink

- Editors and Convenor are asked to Review 32N2505 SC32 Programme of Work and provide update

19763-12 Information Model – Gordon

DIS SC32 N2451

Ballot closes 2013-06-13

Draft comments were shared and discussed and agreed on disposition. WG experts agreed to try to skip FDIS unless there is a “Not Approved” vote, issue a sneak-peek prior to sending text to JTC1 for publishing by 2014-07-30. Revised text will be reviewed by editor and Ray Gates and posted to the WG2 document register for 2 weeks, with a request for SC32 Leadership to send to JTC1 for publishing as IS. As a backup, we also agreed to a resolution of FDIS ballot to be issued by 2014-07-30 (but no later than 2014-09-30), so it would close before the interim meeting.

Resolutions:

1. FDIS 19763-12 Metamodel for information model registration 2014-09-30

DIS Registry Summary ADACHI

DIS SC32 N2453

Ballot closes 2014-06-13

SC32 WG2 Meeting – Convenor’s Notes - Beijing 2014 WG2N1949

Draft comments were discussed. If no “Disapprove” votes are cast in the ballot, agreement was reached to skip FIDS and send revised text for IS to JTC1 for publishing. Editing committee of Adachi and Keith Gordon, to assess a sneak peek of the revised IS and post to WG2 document register by and determine when ready to send JTC1 for ballot no later than 2014-11-30. As a backup, we also agreed to a resolution of FDIS ballot to be issued by 2014-07-30.

Resolutions:

1. Change project editor to Adachi, Tatsumi
2. FDIS Registry summary 2014-09-30

CD5 19763-7 Service Registration FENG, Zaiweng

Ballot closed 2014-05-07. Obtained Substantial Support:75 total comments, no technical comments. Comments were discussed and agreed. Editing committee of Ziaweng and Keith Gordon, to provide a sneak peek of the revised IS by 2014-09-30. Resolution to submit DIS Ballot by 2014-11-30

Resolutions:

1. Request name change for 19763-7 from Metamodel for service registration to Metamodel for service model registration
2. Request to add Co-editor Zaiwen FENG (CN)
3. DIS 19763-7 Metamodel for service model registration 2014-11-30

19763-9 Technical report for on demand model selection (ODMS) WANG (Jain)

PDTR5 SC32 N2461

Ballot closed 2014-05-07

SC32 N2485 – Summary Voting

Obtained Substantial Support: Approved 6, Approved with Comments 2,

Disapproval with comment 0, Abstention 5

11 total comments, 1 technical

WG2 N1930 Draft disposition of comments

Comments were resolved. Agreed to sneak-peek by 2014-09-31. Agreed to progress to DTR ballot by 2014-11-30

Resolution:

1. Add co-editor Co-editor Jian WANG (CN)
2. DTR 19763-9 On demand model selection 2014-11-30

11179-1 Metadata Registries (MDR) - Part 1: Framework ED3

Gillman/Farance

CD3 SC32 N2455

Ballot Closed 2014-04-27

Obtained Substantial Support: Approved 5, Approved with Comments 1, Disapprove 2, Abstain 5

39 total comment, 9 technical

Comments were discussed and disposed successfully. WG experts agreed to submit a resolution to approve a DIS Ballot to be issued by 2014-07-30, and also a

SC32 WG2 Meeting – Convenor’s Notes - Beijing 2014 WG2N1949

resolution for an FDIS after the interim meeting due to the minimum number of comments, it is expected to progress and after DIS.

Resolutions:

1. Add co-editor Frank Farance
2. DIS 11179-1 Metadata registries - Framework 2014-07-31
3. FDIS 11179-1 Metadata registries - Framework 2015-01-31

11179-5 Naming Principles NEWTON, Judy

The DIS ballot for Part-5 closes 2014-06-13, so we could only discuss comment informally. Judy reviewed the preliminary US, Japanese and Canadian comments. If there are no other comments, there doesn't seem to be a need for a separate meeting to resolve them. These are sufficiently simple to resolve with just consensus at the current meeting.

The only issue raised was a comment from Canada about Part 2. It was resolved to create a new edition of Part 2, possibly as a TR, but the current Part 2 should not be referenced in this part. References to 1117903 clause 9.2 Classifications would be more appropriate.

It is anticipated that these changes can be made with little impact to the overall body of the draft, and that we may be able to progress this to IS without an FDIS unless there is a Disapprove on the DIS Ballot. The Convenor request that Judy prepare the FDIS by 2014-08-15, and publish the sneak-peek to WG2 document register, requesting feedback within 2 weeks. If there are no objections, the Editor and Convenor will make a recommendation to SC32 leadership to skip the FDIS ballot and send the text to JTC1 for publishing as an IS.

Resolutions:

1. FDIS 11179-5 Naming principles 2014-09-30

11179-6 Registration GATES, Ray

The CD Ballot comments were reviewed and resolved by telecon with Ray Gates. One area of discussion was that Canada, Japan and the US commented about Designation and Definition being optional in 11179-3, but mandatory for “Incomplete” items. The group eventually decided that it should be consistent between 11179-6 and 11179-3 constraints on this item at the incomplete level, such that a registered item not to contain a designation or definition. It can be viewed by its identifier, since all registered items must be identified items.

It is anticipated the these changes from the ballot can be made with little impact to the overall body of the draft, and that we may progress this to DIS. Also, due to minimal comments on the CD, we expect to be able to issue FDIS after the Toronto interim meeting.

SC32 WG2 Meeting – Convenor’s Notes - Beijing 2014 WG2N1949

Resolutions:

1. Request project editor change to Ray Gates
2. DIS 11179-6 Metadata registries - Registration2014-07-31
3. FDIS 11179-6 Metadata registries - Registration2015-01-31

19763-5 Metamodel for Process model registration He, K. & Wang, Chong

DIS Ballot has not closed. Chong led discussion of early comments were discussed and successfully disposed. A few minor changes are needed, but WG believes this is ready to progress to IS. The Convenor request that editor prepare the draft of FDIS by 2014-08-15, and publish the sneak-peek to WG2 document register, requesting feedback within 2 weeks. If there are no objections, the Editor and Convenor will make a recommendation to SC32 leadership to skip the FDIS ballot and send the text to JTC1 for publishing as an IS.

Resolutions:

1. Add co-editor Chong Wang
2. FDIS 19763-5 Metamodel for process model registration 2014-09-30

19763-13 Metamodel for forms registration HARRIS, Steve

CD2 SC32 N2475

Ballot Closed 2014-06-03

Obtained substantial Support: Obtained Substantial Support: Approved 5, Approved with Comments 2, Disapprove 2, Abstain 5

88 total comments, 20 technical + US Informal comments

Comments were discussed and agreed, but were significant enough to diagrams and text that WG feels we need a CD, and request resolution to issue CD3 ballot by 2014-08-15. We anticipate that we will continue to work on CD3 until such time we are ready for DIS, but also provisionally request a DIS ballot to be issued after Interim meeting in Toronto, by 2015-01-15. If the document is not ready by January for DIS, the CD3 resolutions will continue.

Resolutions:

1. Title change from 19763-13 Metamodel for forms registration to Metamodel for form design registration
2. CD3 19763-13 Metamodel for forms registration 2014-11-30
3. DIS 19763-13 Metamodel for forms registration 2015-01-11

Open Discussion and new business

MDR and MFI Reorg: Keith Gordon – in the future MDR and MFI could be merged into one cohesive standard with parts that describe the notion of a metadata registry, with mappings and registration of different kinds of metadata. Withdraw MDR and MFI.

SC32 WG2 Meeting – Convenor’s Notes - Beijing 2014 WG2N1949

This could be approached by reorganizing all the parts into one ISO Project, and writing a new introduction that explains the overarching metadata registration. However, we have just approved NWI TR 19583 – Metadata Concepts and Metadata Usage.

Experts agreed to keep this idea in the background as we develop the TR and revisit over time to see if it might be achievable.. Concerns are that other standards reference 11179 and eventually 19763, so withdrawing them could be a problem for adaptors or other standards work.

Ontology Registration: MFI Part 3 Ed2 stands alone, and ED 3 would provide the opportunity to align it with MFI-10. There are existing ontology services currently available that contain many ontologies, they don’t call themselves registries, but these information resources are in essence registries of ontologies. Common Terminology Services 2 (CTS 2 from OMG standard) is an ontology model for an ontology repositories that has been used by Mayo, NCI. Stanford has an ontology model, used by National Center for Biomedical Computing (NCBO). <http://www.bioontology.org/> Masao Okabe has agreed to research what might be needed and will report on this in Toronto. Also consider common logic and attributes of ontologies that might be useful for 24707.

Designation and Definition in 11179-6

Revisited the requirement for designation and definition to be “Incomplete Status” in Part 6, we felt that since a registered item has an identifier, the need for both a name and definition is not essential. Since 11179-3 says they are optional, we feel that for “incomplete status” it is consistent to leave them as optional in part 6.

Dataset Metadata and Data Provenance

The group discussed Big Data and agreed that two new standards are needed in general, and that with the emphasis on Big Data, it was a good tie to begin the work on these to new standards. It is thought that they will be project splits for 11179, but until the working draft is developed, WG experts were not sure if they might be a split of 19763 or even a NWIP. Resolutions for all three approaches for both parts (Datasets and Data Provenance) were proposed to SC32 with a commitment to make a final decision in Toronto.

The general requirement for the Dataset metadata discussed was that there is a requirement for general attributes to describe datasets, many of these have been described in the Big data meetings and will be useful in developing the standard. Other useful general attributes have been described in the various Data.gov dataset registries. An example of research dataset metadata can be found WG2 N1952, text pertaining to dataset metadata is highlighted in yellow.

I anticipate there will be general attributes, such as the name of the dataset, a short description, number of instances, type of file, a pointer to a data dictionary, and a set

SC32 WG2 Meeting – Convenor’s Notes - Beijing 2014 WG2N1949

of domain specific attributes such as for a clinical trial the size of the cohort (see WG2 N1952). The model for registering dataset metadata will need to be extensible to support both the general and domain specific metadata. One category of domain specific metadata may pertain to Privacy/Security metadata, the group was not sure if we have the expertise to develop the domain specific metadata.

Action Items Beijing:

1. Develop liaison report recommending that SC38 SOA WG2 to record 18384 terminology and definitions as a digital resource using SC32 standards and contact WG2. Also, include comparison of definitions the term Service and Process
2. Issue a sneak peek of 19763-9 DTR, 19763-7 and 19763-8 DIS by 2014-08-31. NBs are requested to provide written comments to the sneak peeks using the ISO template and provide them to WG2 by 2014-10-30. Request SC32 approval of Resolution for DIS ballot to be issued after Toronto, 2014-11-30.
3. Issue a sneak peek of 24707 DIS, 2014-09-30, NBs are requested to provide written comments to the sneak peeks using the ISO template and provide them to WG2 by the end of 2014-10-31. Request SC32 approval of Resolution for DIS ballot to be issued after Toronto, 2014-12-31.
4. All NBs are requested to ensure that their designated WG2 Experts are added to ISO LiveLink so they may review WG2 documents.
5. SC32 secretariat is requested to send WG2 convenor ISO project dates on a regular basis.
6. Assign a study group to evaluate 20944 for withdrawal or stabilization.
7. 19583 Metadata concepts and usage should be two parts, a resolution was submitted to make the project split. WG experts agreed that editor of Part 1 and Part should create a working draft for Toronto. Metadata: Usage. Dong Wong Jeong, Denise Warzel, Steve Harris were named to the drafting committee. Target for 2014 Interim meeting, Scope, Overview and Basic Registry Implementation sections.
8. Editors of 11179-1 or 11179-6 are asked to ensure text referring to Clause 9.2 (Classifications Metamodel Region) in 11179-3:2013
9. When submitting comments on all DIS ballots, NBs are asked to also send them WG2 Convenor so that if the ballot does not close before Toronto, they can still informally discuss comments in Toronto.
10. The disposition of comments around 11179-2 are that the part should be refreshed to be consistent with Ed3, and text added, not simply repeated from Part 3. It should refer to definitions in clause 9.2 Classifications
11. 19and clause 9.1 Concepts, not repeat them, add explanatory text and examples of how to use a concept system to define a classification scheme, and a classification scheme to classify administered items. Once a WD is developed, we may decide to cancel converted this part to a TR rather than an IS. The rationale for leaving this part in 11179 versus adding to 19583 is that existing users of 11179 will notice it missing, and if not adopting all of 11179, may not realize that its covered in 11179-3.
12. NBs are requested to ask experts named as liaison to provide justification for existing Liaison activities. For TC 37, please specify which subcommittee. This means experts are committed to producing reports for interim and plenary meetings, otherwise the liaison roles will be removed before the next Plenary.
13. Contact TC 154 Documents and data elements in administration, commerce and industry Basic Semantic Registry for possible Liaison with SC32/WG2 to a subcommittee or working group
14. We are only allowed one liaison per TC/SC, Michael Gruninger and Keith Gordon volunteered. During SC32 Plenary, Keith Gordon volunteered to be the liaison to TC 184/SC4 about ISO 8000
15. Denise Warzel is to determine which WG of TC215 we will liaison with.

SC32 WG2 Meeting – Convenor’s Notes - Beijing 2014 WG2N1949

16. Liaison Category C: Denise to investigate WG2 Liaison for DAMA International ? is this an official liaison relationship? Horiuchi will investigate a list of new Category C liaisons for SC32 and propose in Toronto, in particular IEC TC3 SC 3D, Keith Gordon is willing to provide a report at the next plenary, from which justification could be established.
17. Denise Warzel will be assigned as a temporary liaison to Category C Dublin Core and recommend whether or not to continue.
18. Denise Warzel will investigate liaison to W3C relative to Dataset and Data Provenance metadata and make recommendation after interim meeting.
19. Editors production DIS drafts are requested to try to work out all “Editor’s Notes” prior to issuing the DIS using the List Serv or by contacting the NB.
20. NBs are requested to gather requirements for suggested additions for a new edition of 19763-3 to Masao Okabe for discussion in Toronto. This addition would be harmonized with 19763-10, potentially providing a way to register mappings between ontologies.
21. NBs are requested to submit materials, references to existing standards on Datasets and data Provenance to WG2 Convenor before the Toronto meeting. The WG2 list will be used to continue discussions on these topics. Both parts are a good means by which to invite new members to WG2 to help in the development of these two standards.

SC32 WG2 Meeting – Convenor’s Notes - Beijing 2014 WG2N1949

Attendees:

National Body	Member	Representing
<i>Korea</i>	1. Dongwon Jeong	19583 Report on Study Group MDR and MFI Implementation djeong@kunsan.ac.kr
<i>United Kingdom</i>	2. Keith Gordon	19763-12, 19763-10 (co-editor), 19763-1 (co-editor) kfgordon@bis.org.uk
	3. Steve Harris	19763-13 Form Design steve.harris@ndcls.ox.ac.uk
<i>United States</i>	4. Judith Newton - Via Telecon	11179-5
	5. Denise Warzel	Convenor/Delegate
	6. Frank Farance - Via Telecon	11179-1 co-editor
<i>Canada</i>	7. Michael Gruninger	24707 gruninger@mie.utoronto.ca
	8. Ray Gates - Via Telecon	11179-6
	9. Baba Piprani	Study Group Cloud Computing
<i>Japan</i>	10. Hajime HORIUCHI	19763-1 JACIC
	11. Tatsumi ADACHI	19763-6 (HOD) NEC t-adachi@gv.jp.nec.com
	12. Masao Okabe	19763-1 Tokyo Institute of Technology
<i>China</i>	13. Chong WANG	19763-5 Wuhan cwang@whu.edu.cn
	14. Jian WANG	19763-9 (TR) CESI
	15. Zaiwen FENG	19763-7 - zwfeng@wu.edu.cn
	16. Fei HE	19763-8 Wuhan hefei.kh@whu.edu.cn

SC32 WG2 Meeting – Convenor’s Notes - Beijing 2014 WG2N1949

	17. Zhang Zhao Yuan	CESI zhangzhaoy@cesi.cn
	18. Yang Ying	CESI yangying@cesi.cn